

Counting More than Income When Measuring Alumni Success

2014 Assessment Institute in Indianapolis

October 20, 2014

Angie L. Miller, Ph.D.

Amber D. Lambert, Ph.D.

Center for Postsecondary Research, Indiana University



**STRATEGIC
NATIONAL ARTS ALUMNI
PROJECT**

Presentation Outline

- Literature Review: the need for alumni assessment
- The problem with income
- An Example: The Strategic National Arts Alumni Project (SNAAP)
 - Traditional success measures
 - Additional education/degrees
 - Relevance of institutional training to career
 - Job satisfaction



Literature Review

- There is an increasing trend for requiring colleges and universities to show measures of their effectiveness (Kuh & Ewell, 2010)
 - Combination of struggling economy, funding cuts to higher education, and evolution of traditional higher education model (i.e. distance education, MOOCs, etc.)
- One important measure of effectiveness is alumni success in the workplace (Cabrera, Weerts, & Zulick, 2005)



Literature Review

- Certain fields in particular have recently been under scrutiny for the career outcomes of their graduates
 - Architecture, arts & humanities, law
- Data indicates that some majors have disappointingly low income levels, especially among recent college graduates (Carnevale, Cheah, & Strohl, 2012)



The problem with income...

- While institutions want to verify alumni employment, using income as the “end-all-be-all” measure of career success may not capture a complete vision of successful outcomes

Contextual factors

- What is “enough” when it comes to income?
 - Location and subsequent cost of living plays a large role



The problem with income...

Contextual factors

- What if the alumni pursued further education?
 - If a substantial number of undergraduate alumni are currently pursuing an advanced degree, their income might be minimal
- Some fields of work (i.e. arts, education) are not generally associated with large monetary incentives
 - Alumni never expected to be making high income



The problem with income...

- Given these issues, we may want to know about alumni not only their current job(s) and income level, but also:
 - Whether they received additional education after their time at their institutions
 - The relevance of their work to their educational experiences
 - Their satisfaction within their occupations
- Can gain a wider perspective on the successes of their alumni and the usefulness of their degrees



An Example: The Strategic National Arts Alumni Project (SNAAP)



SNAAP

- To address the research questions, we will present findings from the Strategic National Arts Alumni Project (SNAAP)
- What is SNAAP?
 - Online annual survey designed to assess and improve various aspects of arts-school education
 - Investigates the educational experiences and career paths of arts graduates nationally
 - Findings are provided to educators, policymakers, and philanthropic organizations to improve arts training, inform cultural policy, and support artists



Who does SNAAP survey?

- Participants drawn from:
 - Arts high schools
 - Independent arts colleges
 - Arts schools, departments, or programs in comprehensive colleges/universities
 - Have respondents at high school, undergraduate, and graduate levels
- Cohort Year Sampling
 - 2008 and 2009 Field Tests: 5, 10, 15, & 20 years out
 - 2010 Field Test: 1-5, 10, 15, & 20 years out
 - 2011 and forward: all years to generate the most comprehensive data possible



Increasing Numbers...

- 2011 Administration
 - More than 36,000 respondents
 - 66 institutions
- 2012 Administration
 - More than 33,000 respondents
 - 70 institutions
- 2013 Administration
 - More than 27,000 respondents
 - 48 institutions
- Now able to combine 2011, 2012, and 2013 respondents to create a “SNAAP Database” with over 92,000 respondents



Questionnaire Topics (2011,12,13)

1. Formal education and degrees
2. Institutional experience and satisfaction
3. Current Work
4. Career
5. Arts engagement
6. Income and debt
7. Demographics



Traditional success questions

What is your current employment status?

- Full-time (35 hours or more per week)
- Part-time only (fewer than 35 hours per week)
- Unemployed and looking for work
- In school full-time
- Caring for family full-time
- Retired
- Other (please describe):

In 2011, 2012, & 2013 data, only 4% of alumni reported that they were unemployed and looking for work



Traditional success questions

What was your *individual* annual income in 2012? (Do not include spousal income or interest on jointly-owned assets.)

- \$10,000 or less
- \$10,001 to \$20,000
- \$20,001 to \$30,000
- \$30,001 to \$40,000
- \$40,001 to \$50,000
- \$50,001 to \$60,000
- \$60,001 to \$70,000
- \$70,001 to \$80,000
- \$80,001 to \$90,000
- \$90,001 to \$100,000
- \$100,001 to \$150,000
- More than \$150,000
- I prefer not to answer.

In 2011, 2012, & 2013 data, **66%** of undergraduate alumni and **70%** of graduate alumni reported making at least \$30,000 in the previous year



Traditional success questions

In 2012, what was your total *household* income from all sources?

- \$10,000 or less
- \$10,001 to \$20,000
- \$20,001 to \$30,000
- \$30,001 to \$40,000
- \$40,001 to \$50,000
- \$50,001 to \$60,000
- \$60,001 to \$70,000
- \$70,001 to \$80,000
- \$80,001 to \$90,000
- \$90,001 to \$100,000
- \$100,001 to \$150,000
- More than \$150,000
- I prefer not to answer.

In 2011, 2012, & 2013 data, only **11%** of undergraduate alumni and **9%** of graduate alumni had a household income of less than \$20,000 in the previous year



Further education questions

Please select any degrees or credentials you have pursued in your lifetime at an institution other than Generic School of the Arts. Check all that apply.

I did not pursue any degree at an institution other than Generic School of the Arts.

Certification

Certificate

Undergraduate

Associate Degree

BA

B Arch

BFA

BM or B Mus

BS

Other undergraduate degree (please describe):

Graduate

Artist Diploma

MA

M Arch

MBA

MFA

MM or M Mus

MS

DMA

JD

MD or DO

PhD

Other graduate degree (please describe):

In 2011, 2012, & 2013 data, **34%** of undergraduate alumni reported that they also pursued a graduate level degree



Further education questions

Did you complete this degree/these degrees pursued at another institution?

	No	Yes	In progress
Certificate	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Associate Degree	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
BA	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
B Arch	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
BFA	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
BM or B Mus	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
BS	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Other undergraduate degree	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Artist Diploma	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
MA	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
M Arch	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
MBA	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
MFA	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
MM or M Mus	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
MS	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
DMA	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
JD	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
MD or DO	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
PhD	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Other graduate degree	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>

Recent graduates are more likely to report an “in progress” degree



Further education questions

Please list the names of any educational institutions that you attended *after leaving* Generic School of the Arts.

- Can be useful to get information on whether alumni go on to attend prestigious institutions
- Can also see how “the competition” fares in looking at whether alumni continue their education at other institutions in the same metropolitan area, state, or region



Further education questions

How well did Generic School of the Arts prepare you for your further education?

- Did not pursue further education
- Very well
- Fairly well
- Not too well
- Not well at all

In 2011, 2012, & 2013 data, **56%** of undergraduate alumni reported that their institution prepared them either “very well” or “fairly well” for further education and only **34%** did not pursue further education.



Training relevance questions

After leaving your program at Generic School of the Arts, how long did it take for you to obtain your first job or work experience?

- Obtained work prior to leaving Generic School of the Arts
- Obtained work in less than four months
- Obtained work in four to twelve months
- Obtained work after more than a year
- Have not yet found work
- Did not search for work after leaving program
- Pursued further education

How closely related was your first job or work experience to your training at Generic School of the Arts?

- Closely related
- Somewhat related
- Not related

In 2011, 2012, & 2013 data, **47%** of undergraduate alumni and **62%** of graduate alumni said their first job was “closely related” to their training at their institution



Training relevance questions

After selecting their current primary job from a list of 45 different possibilities, several follow-up questions about this job appear...

Overall, how relevant is your arts training at Generic School of the Arts to your current work in the occupation in which you spend the majority of your work time?

- Very relevant
- Relevant
- Somewhat relevant
- Not at all relevant

In 2011, 2012, & 2013 data, **80%** of undergraduate alumni and **85%** of graduate alumni said their arts training was at least somewhat relevant to their work in the job where they spend the majority of their work time



Job satisfaction questions

Indicate your level of satisfaction with each of the following aspects of your current work in the occupation in which you spend the majority of your work time.

	Very satisfied	Somewhat satisfied	Somewhat dissatisfied	Very dissatisfied
Job security	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Opportunity to be creative	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Income	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Balance between work and non-work life	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Opportunity to contribute to the greater good	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Opportunity for career advancement	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Work that reflects my personality, interests, and values	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>
Overall job satisfaction	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>	<input type="radio"/>

In 2011, 2012, & 2013 data, **81%** of alumni reported they were “very satisfied” or “somewhat satisfied” as their overall job satisfaction



Job satisfaction questions

Exploratory and confirmatory factor analysis found that there are two distinct types of job satisfaction:

Extrinsic (Satisfaction with...)	Intrinsic (Satisfaction with...)
Income	Works that reflects my personality, interests, and values
Job security	Opportunity to be creative
Opportunity for career advancement	Opportunity to contribute to the greater good



Job satisfaction questions

- OLS regression analyses indicate that intrinsic and extrinsic job satisfaction can be predicted by certain demographic characteristics
- Income was the strongest predictor of extrinsic satisfaction
 - Those with higher incomes have higher extrinsic satisfaction
- Working in an arts field was the strongest predictor of intrinsic job satisfaction
 - Those who spend a majority of their work time in an arts field have higher intrinsic satisfaction



Conclusions

- Assessing alumni can provide important information on institutional effectiveness
- Traditional measures of employment and income may not provide the most accurate or complete information on alumni success
- Additional information about further education and degrees, the relevance of their institutional training, and multiple aspects of their current job satisfaction is needed in order to gain a more comprehensive understanding of alumni



Questions or Comments?

- Contact Information:
 - Angie L. Miller anglmill@indiana.edu
 - Amber D. Lambert adlamber@indiana.edu

Strategic National Arts Alumni Project (SNAAP)

www.snaap.indiana.edu

(812) 856-5824

snaap@indiana.edu



References

Cabrera, A.F., Weerts, D.J., & Zulick, B.J. (2005). Making an impact with alumni surveys. *New Directions for Institutional Research*, 2005: 5-17. doi: 10.1002/ir.144

Carnevale, A.P., Cheah, B., & Strohl, J. (2012). *College majors, unemployment, and earnings: Not all college degrees are created equal*. Washington, DC: Center of Education and the Workforce, Georgetown University.

Evers, F.T., Rush, J.C., & Berdrow, I. (1998). *The bases of competence: Skills for lifelong learning and employability*. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.

Kuh, G. D. & Ewell, P. T. (2010). The state of learning outcomes assessment in the United States. *Higher Education Management and Policy*, 22(1), 1-20.

Tait, H., & Godfrey, H. (1999). Defining and assessing competence in generic skills. *Quality in Higher Education*, 5(3), 245-253.

